



## 2018 SOCIAL SCIENCES NUCLEI COMPETITION

### Recommendations of the Program Committee in Social Sciences

Taking into consideration the grades of the New and Renewing Proposals submitted to the **2017 Social Sciences Nuclei Competition**, as well as the results of the in-person interviews carried out between **March 5<sup>th</sup> and March 8<sup>th</sup> 2018**, the Millennium Science Initiative Program Committee recommends to the Advisory Board the following ranking for the awarding of both types of proposals:

#### 1) RANKING OF THE PROJECTS RECOMMENDED TO BE AWARDED ACCORDING TO THEIR MERITS

##### 1. Millennium Nucleus for the Study of the Life Course and Vulnerability; Principal Investigator: Salinas

This highly experienced team have presented an innovative proposal which will explore the multiple relationships between life course events and vulnerability. In essence, the thesis is that the accumulation of life course disadvantages poses serious inequalities of opportunity with respect to educational attainment, labor market participation, health and wellbeing and family dynamics. The approach is not only new in Chile, but adopts a strong theoretical perspective which should make impressive contributions to knowledge on the world stage. Using existing survey and administrative datasets, combined with new qualitative and even experimental studies opens up possibilities to address the issues of inequality in a more holistic way through the triangulation of concepts and methods. This extensive programme of work will benefit from existing projects which are already underway. The team demonstrates a strong awareness of ethical issues, are clearly highly experienced in training early career researchers and have very important links to public institutions that are necessary to fully exploit their outreach potential.

##### 2. Millennium Nucleus The Exercise of Authority in Chilean society. Rearticulations of the Social Handling of Power Asymmetries in Social Relationships; Principal Investigator: Araujo

This proposal offers a cogent perspective on and rigorous conceptual framework for analyzing authority in Chilean society. The methodologies that will be employed in three lines of research are coherently rationalized in terms of the kind of data needed to develop such an analysis. As such, the nucleus promises to generate novel insights into a range of issues relating to social organization and power relations in the context of work, family, and urban space, and to make a genuine contribution to both academic and public debate. The research plan is very well organized, and the different responsibilities of respective team members – who have excellent academic records – are clearly defined and complementary. Finally, it provides a clear strategy of knowledge mobilization.



### **3. Millennium Nucleus in Energy and Society; Principal Investigator: Arizfía**

In its first three years, the nucleus produced significant research on the social and political dimensions of the transition from carbon-based to renewable energy in Chile. The nucleus was very active, with many publications and intensive network and outreach activities, and both the director and alternate director have been very productive in terms of publications. In the next phase, the team expects to work on the politics and social conflicts related to energy transition, governance, regulation and the technological dimensions of the transition process. It is a strong and committed team, with significant policy and outreach activities.

### **4. Millennium Nucleus Mobilities and Territories; Principal Investigator: Jirón**

This highly experience team have produced a very innovative proposal which promises to develop new insights in the fields of urban planning and mobility by developing a new way to understand the construction and re-construction of territories, spaces and places in a dynamic plain through the inter-connections between movement, body and everyday life. This will place movement through space within the realms not just of 'meaning making' but also provides an opportunity to explore the ways in which mobility, transportation and place intersect to both provide and constrain opportunity. The links between this pattern of opportunities and constraints need, however, to be tied more closely to more tangible of concrete messages which can input to urban policy. The team plans to use a very interesting mix of methods including use of survey data, spatial data and qualitative data, most notably the use of 'shadowing' where participant observation is joined with interviewing and visual methods and with which they have already gained substantial experience. The team was less convincing on how they would produce a coherent combined analysis of this range of data. There is a good outreach plan to involve a range of relevant stakeholders in terms of the products of the research. Training and mentoring of students and early career researchers is well planned.

### **5. Millennium Nucleus in Social Development; Principal Investigator: Duarte**

The proposal addresses an issue of high importance – social development and human wellbeing - where the team has the potential both to undertake high quality research and also make a valuable contribution to policy. The team members have the necessary skills and experience to make this an excellent study. The team is composed primarily of economists, making use of methodologies that are well-established in economics, and in addition the team demonstrated during the interview that they are open to other innovative ideas and methods. The team also appears to have good opportunities for productive outreach activities.



**6. Millennium Nucleus to Improve the Mental Health of Adolescents and Youths: Martínez-Nahuel**

This highly experienced team of psychologists, medical scientists and engineers proposes a comprehensive research programme which addresses the socially relevant domain of mental health in adolescents and youth in Chile. The research is well thought out, clearly based in existing literature and the objectives are clear, ambitious but achievable given the expertise in the team. The focus on interventions should result in a strong empirical base for the development of effective services. The participatory design will ensure relevancy to the targeted populations. The applied nature of the study, combined with good quality research and dissemination, promises to make a positive difference to the lives of young people affected by the mental health problems. It is good to see that analysis of cost effectiveness is involved. The link to policy development and location of mental health issues not just at the individual, but also at the relational and organizational (particularly the school) level, is admirable. The organization of the work into different streams makes good sense.

**7. Millennium Nucleus, Student Experience in Higher Education in Chile: Expectations and Realities; Principal Investigator: González**

The proposal is to create the first research group on higher education in Chile, looking at the transitions from secondary school to higher education, the student experience in higher education, the quality of the education received, and the medium and long-term benefits of higher education. On the basis of the approach and methodology outlined in the proposal, this comes across as of a very high standard of scientific quality and the research team's qualifications and experience are eminently suitable to the work. The qualifications of the research team and the work envisaged include a range of disciplines – education, quantitative methods and evaluation, psychology and law.

**8. Millennium Nucleus Art, Performativity and Activism; Principal Investigator: Grass**

This is an unusual and highly innovative proposal. It promises both to offer insights into an issue of particular significance in Chile – political activism as performance - at the same time opening up for the adoption of novel research methods. The team builds on a wide-ranging body of competence and experience. The team has relevant experience with novel methods both of obtaining and communicating their insights. The research is certainly experimental in nature, and has the potential to be truly innovative.

**9. Millennium Nucleus Center for Socioeconomic Impact of Environmental Policies; Principal Investigator: Arriagada**

The goal of the group has been to assess the sustainability (environmental, social and economic) of public policies related to the environment, understanding

individual behavior, causal links and economic impacts. The current research projects seek to expand their work by bringing the contributions of social sciences to environment programs and policies. It is a consistent proposal, with a strong track record and with practical policy relevance. The research objectives are clear and appear to be relevant to the national context in Chile. The broader justification of areas are well posed with links to SDG agenda and the initiative of the Intergovernmental Panel on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services (IPBES). Both of these indicate potential for research to impact beyond the region.

## **2) PROJECTS RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING (RESERVE LIST)**

### **10. Millennium Nucleus in Mental Health; Principal Investigator: Saldivia**

This experienced transdisciplinary team have identified a relevant public health problem for Chile: that of the mental health of young people and elderly populations. A strength of the proposal lies in its focus not just on the production and evaluation of mental health interventions but also in its ambition to raise social awareness of mental health. The choice to adopt a multi methods approach will enable a broad perspective is taken on this problem area, and the skill and expertise in the team to conduct Random Controlled Trials will ensure high quality data on the effectiveness on the interventions. The team were not critical of the limitations of the chosen methods and how such limitations impact on the quality and value of the derived conclusions. The focus on health care centres as the main domain of service and intervention delivery is important but the team needs to consider reach into vulnerable populations. The outreach programme will reach into existing and develop new networks. The plan is to develop a series of mechanisms for targeting different, relevant audiences via standard academic practices combined with outreach through social media to a variety of audiences including healthcare professionals, young people, carers and older people. The team's connectedness with relevant social institutions and actors has the potential to enable to project to have extensive influential reach.

### **11. Millennium Nucleus on the Challenges to Representation: Castiglioni**

The goal of the nucleus is to better understand the issues related to political representation that may explain the puzzle of growing political alienation in Chile in spite of its achievements in economic development, poverty reduction and democratic consolidation. The current proposal is to deal with inequality of treatment and procedural (in)justice, political identities and populism, and political activism and abstentionism. It is a well-conceived project, up to date with the current literature on the subject, and with significant activities of human capital development and extension work. It would have benefited from more explanation on how the particular issue of electoral participation is to be analytically connected to wider phenomenon of political participation also addressed in proposed research. Finally, the committee would have benefited from a clearer outline of what the nucleus has accomplished thus far in relation to its original plans, and how this is to be related to its new research.



### 3) PROJECTS NOT TO BE AWARDED

#### **12. Millennium Nucleus for Mining-based Territorial Development; Principal Investigator: Paredes**

The team is competent to address this important topic in Chile; however, it might have benefited from including a political scientist or sociologist given the focus in the proposal on governance. There were many topics to be covered under the different research lines, raising some doubt about whether this was achievable in three years. To the extent that the research is intended to enhance the mining industry, the proposed social and environmental research is supplementary and directed at managing negative externalities. This raised the question about whether the research was primarily about science or intervention. Given that the contested nature of this field, more discussion of how conflicting stakeholders would be constructively engaged would have clarified the nature of the proposed interventions.

#### **13. Millennium Nucleus in Management Practices for Organizational Competitiveness and Value; Principal Investigator: Mingo**

The team is very competent, and the proposed research concerns the relatively low level of innovation in Chile which is of clear national importance. Building on a number of disciplines falling broadly within business management, the approach proposed is well thought out. The studies to be undertaken raise substantial methodological challenges. This was discussed in the interview, but the team were not fully convincing regarding their ability to meet these challenges.

#### **14. Millennium Nucleus for the Assessment and Development of 21st Century Competences; Principal Investigator: Preiss**

This experienced team has produced a well-articulated proposal to produce new knowledge in the area of 21<sup>st</sup> Century competencies; i.e. those skills which citizens will require to take their place in the labor market, succeed in education and adapt to the technological developments in society which threaten to impose barriers to social mobility. The proposed nucleus will undertake a single, multi-staged complex study based on a solid grounding in several methodological domains. There is some concern that the locus of the intervention at grade 7 may be too late in children's developmental trajectory and this will need to be carefully considered by the team. In addition, it is not clear how the team will persuade policy makers in the area of education to adapt the National curriculum to better reflect the development of necessary competencies. The production of a teacher's handbook and work with teachers in schools promises to begin this transitional process. The team has a reasonably robust young researcher and student programme which is sensitive to the promotion of gender equality.



**15. Millennium Nucleus New Constitution, Democracy, and Economic Performance; Principal Investigator: Negretto**

This proposal addresses fundamental issues of political and institutional change, and offers an interesting program of empirical research utilizing a mix of quantitative and qualitative methods. The criteria for comparatively analyzing cases of constitutional change, and for assessing their degree of success or failure in terms of supporting or undermining democracy, might have been more clearly articulated. The committee was interested to hear more about how the research might produce surprising findings and novel insights beyond original hypotheses. It would also have been helpful if there had been more discussion of the forms that collaboration would take among team members in terms of designing research and developing ongoing analyses, and executing the research plan.

**16. Millennium Nucleus Migration, Policies and Interculturality; Principal Investigator: Stefoni**

This is a highly topical subject, on which the team brings together considerable experience. The case for the specificity of Chile, beyond South-South migration, might have been made more persuasively. Most importantly, the proposed research needs more focus and direction. Thus it covers topics as diverse as immigration and health, human mobility in border regions, and Chilean emigration and exile, and also proposes to carry out a multi-scalar analysis on these. Moreover, it strives to produce theoretical and methodological innovations without giving enough indication about what the nature of these might be. Consequently, the expected outcomes of the research are not evident. More clarity on how the research would be disseminated, as well as on the content of the seminars, colloquiums, and other forms of outreach planned, would have further strengthened the proposal.

**17. Millennium Nucleus Inclusion and Exclusion in the Labor Market: Conditions for Development: Mora**

The team comprises a wide range of disciplines and the proposal addresses an important issue – inclusion and exclusion in the labour market. The central hypothesis is clear and credible, focusing on processes of social closure; and the three lines along which the work is organized seem well chosen: working conditions; associativity and collective bargaining; and pensions and social policies. However, the objectives of the study as set out in the proposal are highly ambitious, especially in methodological terms; and there is some doubt whether these would be achieved.

**18. Millennium Nucleus for the Analysis of Structural Tensions in Contemporary Society: Luna**

The project seeks to develop a general theory of social tensions and crisis, under the general assumption that the demographic, technological and consumption



developments in many societies have surpassed the capability of modern states to deal with them, leading to frustration and social conflicts. The research project is to apply the theory in the analysis of specific cases in Chile, looking at specific situations of urban slums, the Araucania Lumber Complex, Calama and the Northern Border, and Chilean islands and coast. It is an ambitious and intriguing project, but the committee was not convinced that the rather extensive theoretical approach was adequate to fully account for the specificities of the different case studies.

**19. Millennium Nucleus Age-Friendly Cities for Older People; Principal Investigator: Herrera-Ponce**

This is a team of highly experienced academic experts working across multiple disciplinary perspectives in order to study age friendly cities in Chile. The research promises to produce novel information at a city level but it is unclear how the city cases will inform urban development at the National level. However, the team may struggle to develop truly innovative theoretical and methodological insights into the problem because of their reliance on existing contested models; for example, the lack of attention to psychological issues such as sense of place or sense of belonging. A further weakness lies in the lack of articulation of older adults as a heterogeneous group. There needs to be more thought concerning the inclusion of highly vulnerable older adults in the conceptual and methodological development of the research. There is a good mix of methods which indicates transdisciplinary working practices across the team. A key strength of the work programme lies in the involvement of several important stakeholder groups across the duration of the project. The plans for training of a critical mass of researchers in the area were adequately developed.

**20. Millennium Nucleus on Hidrosocial Territories; Principal Investigator: Prieto**

The proposal concerns an extremely important issue - sustainable water management in arid zones - and adopts an approach that emphasises the social, political and cultural as well as biophysical nature of water. While this perspective has considerable merit, and the team is strong in terms of interdisciplinarity, it is far from clear that the proposed approach, based on this perspective, and the concept of 'hidrosocial territory', would be effectively implemented.

**21. Millennium Nucleus of Regional Differences in Human Development; Principal Investigator: Kruger**

The proposal addresses an important issue – regional inequalities in Chile – and the team has good and relevant experience in working on the topic. The focus on three lines of research - in education, labour, and health – seems well chosen. While a wide range of different techniques for undertaking the research were named in the proposal, or referred to during the interview, it is not clear that these would be effectively applied to the specific research questions listed.



**22. Millennium Nucleus Center for Research on Inclusive Labor Markets; Principal Investigator: Martínez-Alvear**

The proposal addresses an important issue - the barriers facing disadvantaged groups in the labor market - and includes the evaluation of policies that can be implemented to improve access. The team is well qualified in terms of academic background and experience. They appear to have the necessary competence with regard to the economic theories and methodologies to be adopted, but their claim to be adopting a multidisciplinary approach does not fit well with the relatively weak team competence in other disciplines.

**23. Millennium Nucleus of Research in Migration and Local Development; Principal Investigator: Zunino**

This proposal addresses the complexity of mobilities as relating to local development processes. It strives to decentralize knowledge production, thus demonstrating the importance of locality. The central terms and lines of research needed to be more effectively delineated, and within these, the methodologies needed to be more carefully laid out and justified. Moreover, the overarching conceptual framework informing nucleus' proposed work was not evident. Consequently, it was not clear how the various strands of the research were to come together to yield a set of meaningful conclusions. The nature of the interventions to result from the research remains vaguely articulated; for example, enabling local actors to pursue their visions for 'development'. The proposal needed to be more specific in how it would achieve its stated aim of contributing to policy, as well as how it might foster dialogue between relevant actors, agencies and organizations.

**24. Millennium Nucleus in Consumer Culture and Society; Principal Investigator: De Simone**

The objective of the project was to examine and discuss the consumer culture in Chile, the impact of new technologies in consumption patterns, and the characteristics of new consumer spaces. In spite of the importance of the subject and the qualifications of the proponents, the committee considered that the research proposal was not satisfactory enough in terms of the concepts, the themes, levels of analysis and cases studies, making it difficult to identify the focus, mission and vision of the research strategy. The proposal might have been further strengthened by a stronger interdisciplinary conceptual framework that enables consumption to be situated in relation to other aspects of social and political structures and phenomena, and by making a better argument for what is unique and at stake in the Chilean case.

**25. Millennium Nucleus Models of Crises: The Chilean Case; Principal Investigator: Mascareño**

The team has worked on the development of a general theory of crisis, with the participation of sociologists, computer scientists, philosophers, historians and economics, and has an impressive publication record from the first phase. The





current project lines are the modeling of social theories, taking as example the mathematical modelling of migration interactions; critical interactions between nature and society, taking as example the Chiloé red tide crisis; the dual role of norms, based on a semantic analysis of the 11 volumes of the Ortúzar Comisión; and the paradoxes of policy intervention, through an analysis the problems related with Chile's pension system. For the committee, however, the substantive results of the first period and the subjects to be researched in the new proposal do not seem to warrant the ambition of developing a highly formalized social theory as intended by the team.

**26. Millennium Nucleus of Evolutionary Processes, Anthropization and the Climate Change; Principal Investigator: Martínez-Reyes**

This proposal addresses the complexity of urban sprawl in coastal zones, with a view to contributing to coastal resilience planning, integrated management and policy change. The interdisciplinary expertise of the team members reflects that the subject matter spans transformations in the social and natural world, and their interrelation. The social aspects of the research could have been expanded to include a more in-depth social analyses of urbanization, migration, and development. Analytically, the distinctive aspects of the research program needed to be more thoroughly integrated. The different methodologies needed to be clarified, and it was not clear how different kinds of findings resulting from the various methodologies would be correlated. Moreover, the impact of the research was conceived in terms of a rationalist planning and management model, and would have benefited from a more complex and dynamic conceptualization of social and political – as well as environmental – change.



## Final Grade Evaluation Criteria for New and Renewing Proposals

<b>NEW PROPOSALS</b>		<b>%</b>
<b>Written Proposal Grade</b>		<b>50%</b>
<p><b>Scientific, technical and methodological merit.</b> Clarity and forcefulness of the presentation as well as spoken defense of the proposal will be evaluated, considering the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Evaluation of the proposal in regards to the rest of the proposals competing for funding.</li> <li>- Degree of multi and transdisciplinary approach of the proposal.</li> <li>- Focus of the proposal placed in areas relevant to the country and the world, that address a problem where our country has a comparative advantage in terms of scientific research, or that provide some other type of contribution to the society.</li> <li>- Research proposal that differs from those currently covered by the Millennium Centers that are active at the time of application.</li> <li>- Level, solidity as well as organizational and integrated management skills of the group of Associate Researchers.</li> <li>- For Directors and/or Alternate Directors who have held this role in the past, the following will be evaluated: percentage of budget execution and refunding, timely compliance with the delivery of follow-up reports and compliance with the diffusion and implementation of PME.</li> </ul>		<b>50%</b>
<b>FINAL GRADE (weighted average)</b>		<b>100%</b>



<b>RENEWING PROPOSALS</b>		<b>%</b>
<b>Written Proposal Grade</b>		50%
	<p><b>Scientific, technical and methodological merit.</b> Clarity and forcefulness of the presentation as well as spoken defense of the proposal will be evaluated, considering the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Previous accomplishments of the Institute</li> <li>- Evaluation of the proposal in regards to the rest of the proposals competing for funding.</li> <li>- Degree of multi and transdisciplinary approach of the proposal.</li> <li>- Focus of the proposal placed in areas relevant to the country and the world, that address a problem where our country has a comparative advantage in terms of scientific research, or that provide some other type of contribution to society.</li> <li>- Research proposal that differs from those currently covered by Millennium Centers that are active at the time of application.</li> <li>- Level, solidity as well as organizational and integrated management skills of the group of Associate Researchers.</li> <li>- Previous managerial performance of the Center: percentage of budget execution and refunding, timely compliance with the delivery of follow-up reports and compliance with the diffusion and implementation of outreach activities.</li> </ul>	50%
<b>FINAL GRADE (weighted average)</b>		<b>100%</b>



### Social Sciences Interviews Final Grades

<b>Name of the Proposal</b>	<b>Type</b>	<b>PI's Last Name</b>	<b>Written Proposal Grade (50%)</b>	<b>Interview grade (50%)</b>	<b>Final grade</b>	<b>Status</b>
Millennium Nucleus for the Study of the Life Course and Vulnerability	New	Salinas	183,0	105	<b>144,0</b>	Granted
Millennium Nucleus The Exercise of Authority in Chilean society. Rearticulations of the Social Handling of Power Asymmetries in Social Relationships.	New	Araujo	173,0	117	<b>145,0</b>	Granted
Millennium Nucleus in Energy and Society	Renewal	Arizfía	149,9	142	<b>146,0</b>	Granted
Millennium Nucleus Mobilities and Territories	New	Jirón	191,6	109	<b>150,3</b>	Granted
Millennium Nucleus in Social Development	New	Duarte	170,7	133	<b>151,9</b>	Granted
Millennium Nucleus to Improve the Mental Health of Adolescents and Youths	New	Martínez-Nahuel	186,1	146	<b>166,1</b>	Granted
Millennium Nucleus, Student Experience in Higher Education in Chile: Expectations and Realities	New	González	170,4	164	<b>167,2</b>	Granted
Millennium Nucleus Art, Performativity and Activism	New	Grass	169,7	166	<b>167,9</b>	Granted
Millennium Nucleus Center for Socioeconomic Impact of Environmental Policies	Renewal	Arriagada	181,8	156	<b>168,9</b>	Granted
Millennium Nucleus in Mental Health	New	Saldívia	175,2	164	<b>169,6</b>	Granted with no funding
Millennium Nucleus on the Challenges to Representation	Renewal	Castiglioni	115,2	225	<b>170,1</b>	Granted with no funding
Millennium Nucleus for Mining-based Territorial Development	New	Paredes	189,4	153	<b>171,2</b>	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus in Management Practices for Organizational Competitiveness and Value Creation	New	Mingo	166,2	178	<b>172,1</b>	Not granted



Name of the Proposal	Type	PI's Last Name	Written Proposal Grade (50%)	Interview grade (50%)	Final grade	Status
Millennium Nucleus for the Assessment and Development of 21st Century Competences	New	Preiss	189,1	159	174,1	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus Inclusion and Exclusion in the Labor Market: Conditions for Development	New	Mora	178,8	175	176,9	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus New Constitution, Democracy, and Economic Performance: Constitutional Change in Chile in Comparative Perspective	New	Negretto	156,9	197	177,0	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus Migration, Policies and Interculturality	New	Stefoni	156,0	198	177,0	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus for the Analysis of Structural Tensions in Contemporary Society	New	Luna	114,0	240	177,0	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus of Regional Differences in Human Development	New	Kruger	178,8	183	180,9	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus Age-Friendly Cities for Older People	New	Herrera-Ponce	194,1	168	181,1	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus on Hydrosocial Territories	New	Prieto	171,2	191	181,1	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus Center for Research on Inclusive Labor Markets	New	Martínez-Alvear	156,2	206	181,1	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus of Research in Migration and Local Development	New	Zunino	153,6	218	185,8	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus Models of Crises: The Chilean Case	Renewal	Mascareño	180,8	191	185,9	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus in Consumer Culture and Society	New	De Simone	177,2	195	186,1	Not granted
Millennium Nucleus of Evolutionary Processes, Anthropization and the Climate Change Adaptation in Coastal Zones	New	Martínez-Reyes	188,4	184	186,2	Not granted



The in-person interviews were developed in Santiago, Chile with the participation of three members of the Program Committee in Social Sciences: Dr. Desmond McNeill, Dr. Simon Schwartzman and Dr. Judith Sixsmith.

  
Desmond McNeill

  
Simon Schwartzman

  
Judith Sixsmith

Santiago, March 9<sup>th</sup>, 2018